

Some Observations on
The Secret Doctrine Commentaries/
The Secret Doctrine Dialogues

by Daniel H. Caldwell

Part One

It was in late May 1994 that I first saw these *Secret Doctrine Commentaries or Dialogues* **in their original folio notebook format.**

Several months before, I was having one of my regular phone discussions with Dallas Tenbroeck, a ULT student who lived in California. In the course of this discussion he made a vague remark that got my attention. I was puzzled by it. So I did a little research which convinced me that there might be something important here.

Next time we had a phone conversation I asked him to clarify his previous remark and at first he said he didn't remember what he had said. But finally he remembered and said he was referring to old Blavatsky material but **all of it had already been published** either in book format or in the pages of Madame Blavatsky's magazine *Lucifer*.

I was puzzled by his explanation and made a mental note to myself to somehow pursue this.

A few months later I was planning to make a research trip to California to do my Blavatsky research and wanted to be sure to visit Dallas and his wife Valerie. So I arranged to go to his home and asked in advance to see this material we had discussed.

On the day arranged, my wife and I drove from Pasadena, California to Calabasas, California.

We first had lunch in a restaurant in Calabasas and then arrived at the proper time at the Tenbroeck's home.

During our visit I asked to see these notebooks. Dallas went into his garage where he had storage and brought out the material which consisted of 21 folio notebooks.

Again Dallas said all of this material had already been published. But within 5 minutes I could see that this was not the case. Yes, some of it had been published in an edited and abridged form but much of the material had never been published. I pointed all of this out to Dallas.

Here were HPB's answers to many questions about the Stanzas of Dzyan and many of these questions and answers had never been published. I'm sure my blood pressure went up as I realized the true significance of this material!

How did these notebooks find their way from Madame Blavatsky's rooms in London in 1891 to Calabasas in 1994? That was the question in my mind at the time as I held these notebooks.

And the first folio was annotated in HPB's own handwriting. She had once upon a time held this very volume and annotated it....

It is still hard to believe that Dallas had been under the impression that all this material had already been published.

There were only 21 volumes there on the table in front of me...which means **3** were missing. More about this in **Part 2** of this article (see below).

I asked Dallas where he had found these notebooks.

Dallas told me that when B.P. Wadia died in India in 1958, Dallas and a few other members of Wadia's inner circle of associates and workers were assigned to go through Wadia's papers and books at Wadia's home in Ootacamund, India.

Among all these papers, etc. they found these 21 notebooks.

Dallas told me he had no idea how and where Wadia had obtained them. One wonders how many years Wadia had had these volumes in his possession.

As I read through these volumes, I told Dallas that all of this material needed to be published for the benefit of all students of Theosophy.

Part Two

Twenty-four meetings of the Blavatsky Lodge (*from Jan. 10 to June 20, 1889*) were devoted primarily to questions and answers about the cosmogonic Stanzas of Dzyan. Also *The Key to Theosophy* was discussed at a few of these meetings.

If you look at an 1889 calendar, you will see that there were **24 Thursdays** from Jan. 10 up through June 20, 1889.

And if you look in *Lucifer* for Oct. 1890 (pp.164-165), one finds the following relevant information given about these meetings:

"...the 'Transactions' Fund was...started to enable the [Blavatsky] lodge to print its transactions, during the time [in 1889 when] it was receiving instruction on the *Secret Doctrine* from Madame Blavatsky. The first part [Volume I] has already been issued....The [stenographic] reports of these Transactions consist of **twenty-four large longhand folios, four of which have been already printed** [in Part I or Vol. I]...." Bold added.

So we have 24 Thursday meetings of the Blavatsky Lodge and 24 folio notebooks. One notebook per meeting....

But neither Michael Gomes or the Theosophy Company editors mention in their respective Introductions to this Blavatsky material that there were **24 such folio notebooks**.

In the Theosophy Company's introduction to this material, we read on page II:

"...the present work...[is] a complete record of the dialogues H.P. Blavatsky held with her students...."

But if you just turn back four pages from this page II, to one of the Contents pages you will read this statement:

"18. Meeting May 9, 1889. Transcription missing"

If the transcription for this meeting is missing for this May 9, 1889 Blavatsky Lodge meeting, then the "present work" **cannot** be a **complete** record of these dialogues.

And at the bottom of the same Contents page the following statement is to be found:

"No evidence exists that meetings were held May 23 or June 13, 1889."

But.....**there is evidence for these meetings and even specific evidence** for at least one of these meetings, i.e., **the meeting of May 23.**

Turn to pages 557 and 558 in the Theosophy Company edition or in the Gomes edition, pages 573 and 574.

Note well that these pages are from the Meeting of **Thursday, May 30, 1889.**

On the first page cited, Mr. Old says:

"In reference to the whole of paragraph (e), and to some points which were raised **last Thursday**, it would be as well to devote....." bold added.

and on the second page Mr. Old says again:

"It was suggested by Mr. Sinnett **last Thursday**, and also apparently by the paragraph before us, that the Monad...." bold added

Last Thursday?

Last Thursday would be **May 23, 1889.**

I would say here we have specific evidence for there being a meeting on Thursday May 23, not to mention the other evidence indicating there were 24 meetings and 24 folio notebooks.

So we see that there were originally in 1889, 24 notebooks but when Dallas showed them to me there were only 21 notebooks and in both the Theo. Co. edition and the Gomes edition we find just these 21 meetings transcribed.

So three of the original notebooks are missing and therefore we do **NOT** have a complete record of HPB's dialogues with her students.

At the link below I give a detailed breakdown of all of the meetings and notebooks.

https://blavatskyarchives.com/transactions_numbers.jpg

And at the link below is a photograph of one of the covers of one of these folio notebooks.

https://blavatskyarchives.com/transactions_cover.jpg

Below are photos of several pages of the actual 1889 notebooks from the Blavatsky Lodge.

<http://blavatskyarchives.com/kn/tranex1.htm>

http://blavatskyarchives.com/transactions_another.htm

<https://blavatskyarchives.com/transactionsex.htm>